| **Student Name:** Melody |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Nice work on explaining that consistent bad grades are a traumatizing experience for kids. * You want to specify at the very first, who exactly are the kids likely to be harmed by a more accurate representation of the grades. * Good work on trying to create a step-by-step model. But you need a lot more mechanics on what kinds of things you would over-inflate. * Nice work on explaining that some people will choose to quit education because of the harsh grading. * You want to explain how motivation will be effective in driving actual steps necessary for change. * We need more than one argument for the first speaker. * Try to speak for longer. * 2:10 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ashley Hui |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Nice work on explaining that results are often viewed as an important parameter for your self identification. * Nice work on explaining that even kids who perform bad will want to maintain good grades to make sure their parents are proud. * You need to explain why accurate representation of your self worth is not actionable for most students. * Good work on explaining the competitive environment and how parents will still encourage their kids to do better despite good grades. Here, try to show how parents will have something to be proud or happy about in this journey. * Good work on overall detail in your ideas. But we need better time management. * 4:15 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Kris |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Nice work on explaining that people are likely to realize that they were lied to in the future. * You need to also engage with the idea of emotionally fragile students, poor students and also harsher parents. * Good work on explaining how children need to adapt to failure to change their behavior. * You want to explain how failure is not just a diagnosis of their self esteem but will give them specific data points for improvement as well. * Nice work on explaining that there will be shortage of skilled individuals if people have inflated self perception and less actual skill. Try to link this to the social problems this would invite. * Nice work on explaining that some students will take this as an excuse to procrastinate in their studies. * 3:16 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Henry |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Don’t start your debate with a random specific fact and also based on an opinion of an academic. * You want to try to have a roadmap of your speech before your speech. * You need a more structured response than just saying that their argument doesn’t have logic or reasons. You also want to offer reasons why those ideas are not true as well. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Rachel |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * We need to start with a compelling emotive hook. * Good work on identifying that people receive different kinds of treatments based on their grades. You want to explain how this also determines what kind of opportunities parents want to make available for the kids. * You are pausing a lot in the middle of your ideas, you want to create a clearer roadmap during your prep time for this. * Good work on explaining that some people can still get better grades with this motivation. However, it is unclear why this is true for most people and why this will work as an incentive. * 2:49 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Louca Bimar |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Nice characterization of schools and how they shape people’s mindset. * You want to explain how even children are able to rationally learn from their mistakes. Talk about how encouragement and motivation will still be offered by other people. * You want to also engage with specific types of students who are emotionally fragile as well. * Good work on identifying when parents are strict - a better way to make things better is to work on parents instead of children’s grades. * Good work on showing how kids will have a difference in their evaluation when they go to higher levels. You also want to link these grades to real life achievements and explain how exactly you are unable to access this. * You want to explain exactly how this false sense of confidence and inflated self perception will harm kids.   3:18 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Evelynne |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Nice work on explaining that strict comments can affect children’s self perception. Try to explain how protecting children’s mental health is more important than other benefits from direct feedback. * Nice work on explaining how children are in a situation where they are vulnerable to be bad based on strict comments from their teachers. * Try to speak louder than you usually do. Try to also minimize pauses in your sentences. Look at your audience while you speak.   1:55 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Natalie |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that education systems should over-inflate children’s academic self-perception (e.g. providing overwhelmingly positive feedback, avoiding fail grades, etc.). |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | **2** | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The speech length for today’s class is three minutes.   * Good work on the hook. * Nice identification of the ideas from the other side but you need a lot more comparative work to show how your team has won. * You do not create new arguments at reply speech -most of your speech has to be about evaluation of actual debate that has already taken place. * Don’t use your question as a rebuttal. * Nice work on explaining that it is critical for kids to learn why and how they failed and how this can help them in the future.   1:48 | | | | | | |